

MINUTES OF COOLANGATTA AIRPORT ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE (AEC)
MEETING HELD AT GCAL MANAGEMENT CENTRE ON 4 MARCH 1999

IN ATTENDANCE:

Members:

Bob Brock
Colin Dahl
Ray Tate
Reg Payne
Trevor Stephenson
Roger Savage
Vince Sutherland
Greg Carroll
Wilf Arcill
Brian Talbot
Bill Bourke
Pat Masen
Ray White
Jim Boyle
Don James (Acting Chairman)

Airservices Australia
Airservices Australia - Environment Branch
Banora Point Residents Association (West)
Airport Central Corridor Alliance
Bilambil Heights Progress Association
Bilinga Neighbourhood Watch
Dept of Transport & Regional Services
South East Communities Combined Assoc
Friends of Currumbin
Gold Coast & Hinterland Environment Council
Qantas Airways
Tugun Central Neighbourhood Watch
Tugun Progress Association
Tweed District Residents & Ratepayers Assoc
Gold Coast Airport Limited

Proxies:

Greg Marks
Jim MacAnally
Sophie Arnison
Bill Pinkstone
Geoff Edwards
Paul Lamont

for John Langford, Ansett Australia
for Margaret May, Member for McPherson
for Peter Gray, Gold Coast City Council
for Larry Anthony, Member for Richmond
for Don Buckley, Tweed Shire Council
for Don James, Gold Coast Airport Limited

Others:

Pat Ryan
Adrian But
Tony Frodsham
John Moriarty
John Alcorn
Len Wallace
Barry Jephcote
Geoff Tribe
Frank & Eve Bachl
Peter James
Claire Richardson
Amanda Brigden
Rhonda Nunns (Minute Secretary)

Airport Central Corridor Alliance
Airservices Australia - Environment Branch
Airservices Australia
Banora Point & District Residents Association
Barneys Point Residents Action Group
Cudgen Progress Association
East Banora Point Residents Association
East Banora Point Residents Association
Citizens of East Banora District
Tugun Progress Association
Airport Environment Officer (DoTRS)
Gold Coast Airport Limited
Gold Coast Airport Limited

APOLOGIES:

Peter Scott
Greg Cornell
Ian Yarroll

Airservices Australia
General Aviation representative
Qld Department of Environment & Heritage

1. Opening

Don James opened the meeting at 9:05 am. He welcomed everyone to the meeting and advised that he would be chairing the meeting due to the absence of Russell Synnot who was overseas.

In answer to a query from Ray White, Don explained that he was the stand-in Chairman only and Russell would continue to chair the meetings on Gold Coast Airport Limited's behalf.

2. Apologies and Proxies

Apologies and proxies are listed above.

Don introduced Tony Frodsham - Airservices Australia (who will be handling the noise enquiry function from Brisbane) and Vince Sutherland - DoTRS (who is taking over from Mike Rogers).

3. Acceptance of Minutes of Previous Meeting - 5 February 1999

- An amendment to the minutes, in the form of a replacement Page 3 was circulated prior to the meeting (to correct a clerical error).
- Amendment to Page 7 last para requested by Wilf Ardill:
"Qantas aircraft were not turning at 2 DME" should be "Qantas aircraft were not commencing to turn once they had reached 500ft".
- Amendment to Page 7, 7th para requested by Greg Carroll:
"..... suggested an 080° way point" should be "..... suggested an 080° 5DME way point".
- Query by Trevor Stephenson regarding Page 2, 6th para - "The two amendments were agreed to by the Committee" (referring to the amendment of the Terms of Reference by the increase in number of community representatives and the addition of a clause relating to meeting proxies). He queried the validity of this statement, considering there had been no vote taken.

Don James said he wasn't prepared to deal with the membership issue in Russell Synnot's absence. He said a meeting would be convened on Russell's return (around 18 March 1999) between Russell and the community representatives to resolve ongoing concerns in relation to the committee's membership.

A.I. 1

- Amendment to Page 5, 2nd para requested by Trevor Stephenson:
"to review certain flight paths" should be "to review Rwy 32 arrivals".
- Query by Trevor Stephenson regarding Page 6 "Agree Flight Paths and Scope of Flight Path Review". As there was no vote, Trevor argued that the meeting did not agree to the components of the scope of the Flight Path Review as listed in the minutes.

Don James said that this query would be dealt with under Agenda Item 6.

- Reg Payne requested an amendment to the minutes to include his statement that "the representative of Bilambil, which is to the extreme west of the southern runway, lives on the eastern side of the southern runway and therefore has a conflict of interest and should abstain from voting on matters relating to the eastern side of the southern runway."
- Bill Bourke requested an amendment to the minutes to include his statement that "the aviation industry was reticent to support any review of Runway 14 departure flight paths".

Colin Dahl suggested the following amendments on technical grounds:

- Page 6, 1st para "ANEF's" should be "ANEF" (as there is only one ANEF current at any one time).
- Page 7, 1st & 3rd para "NMT readings" should be "NFPMS readings"
- In reference to Page 7, 2nd para "Community reps to consider suitable sites and advise Colin Dahl after the meeting" Colin Dahl said he would accept an instruction from the committee only on suitable sites. This should then be reflected in Action Item 6.

Acceptance of the minutes, incorporating the above amendments was moved by Greg Carroll, and seconded by Paul Lamont; against Ray Tate; CARRIED.

4. Business arising from Minutes - refer list of Action Items

A.I. 1 Completed - attached to Agenda

A.I. 2 Continuing

A.I. 3 Newsletter has not yet been released. To be issued prior to w/c 15/3/99.

A.I. 2

A.I. 4 Vince Sutherland reported that a technical paper was currently being prepared and would be submitted as soon as possible to the AEC.

A.I. 3

A.I. 5 Attached to Agenda

A.I. 6 Colin Dahl will wait on letter from AEC listing:

- definition of the problem which the portable noise monitoring will address or solve; (e.g. impact of Rwy 32 arrivals on Kingscliff/Banora; paper plane effects on Tugun)
- addresses of monitoring sites; and
- what priority is to be given to each site

Don James asked for written submissions from the various community

reps who were requesting the portable noise monitoring in their areas, so that a submission on behalf of the AEC may be forwarded by the Chairman to Colin Dahl.

A.I. 4

A.I. 7 Bob Brock was not present at the time to discuss this item, however Bill Bourke replied that the procedure was "not below 600ft, but no later than 2DME turn to assigned heading". Wilf reiterated his belief that Qantas is crossing the coast at Fiat Rock, whereas Ansett is crossing south of Flat Rock.

Adrian But later distributed to the meeting a paper on the "Investigation of the Performance of Rwy 32 Jet Departures from Coolangatta", the purpose of which was to determine whether there are consistent differences between aircraft types, or between companies, in terms of the performance and tracking of jet aircraft departing from Rwy 32 at Coolangatta.

A.I. 8 Bill Bourke said that the airlines would not go down the track of installing FMS until the matter of the review of southern flight paths had been resolved.

A.I. 9 Report attached to agenda

A.I. 10 - A.I. 13 not dealt with at this time as Bob Brock was not present until later in the meeting.

A.I. 14 Recommendations from the paper plane sub-committee were distributed to meeting. Paul Lamont led the meeting through the recommendations.

a) Recommendation: **THAT** the AEC make representation to the Minister for Transport and Regional Services that paper plane operations cease immediately (for the reasons outlined in the Tweed Residents & Ratepayers Association's submission).

A.I. 5

Ray White emphasised that up to five flights (paper planes) use Coolangatta airport on Saturday mornings.

Jim Boyle and Ray White commented that the noise effects of the paper planes had not been completely eliminated by procedures recently put in place by Impulse Airlines, only shifted around.

Geoff Edwards said that the Tweed Shire Council have on their books a resolution dated 16 December 1998 which requests no increase to current numbers of night time freight operations.

Jim Boyle tabled a letter from TSC to DoTRD dated 23 August 1996 regarding night time aircraft noise.

Brian Talbot felt that the motion to call for cessation of these operations is unrealistic. Public need should be considered by the meeting before putting the motion.

Following the above discussion the recommendation was put.

Moved: Jim Boyle Seconded: Ray White
 For: Reg Payne, Ray Tate, Jim Boyle, Trevor Stephenson,
 Greg Carroll, Ray White, Wilf Ardill, Roger Savage,
 Peter Masen, Jim MacAnally
 Against: Brian Talbot, Vince Sutherland, Bill Bourke, Greg Marks,
 Geoff Edwards, Paul Lamont
 Abstained: Colin Dahl, Sophie Arnison, Bill Pinkstone
 Motion CARRIED

Jim MacAnally commented that GCAL could do more to police the actions of pilots who do not comply with the current procedures. Paul Lamont replied that this was not within GCAL's jurisdiction. The most GCAL could do was to explain to the airlines involved what the intent of the committee was and encourage them to comply for the benefit of the community.

- b) Recommendation: **THAT** as an interim measure, pending a decision from the Minister on cessation of night time freight operations, the AEC endorse the procedures for Impulse operations as set down in their Flight Standing Order 32/98 and recommend to Impulse Airlines that all night time freight operations into Coolangatta comply with these procedures. A.I. 6

(Paul Lamont to further liaise with Impulse to determine a possibly better radial for Rwy 14 arrivals that will ensure a greater clearance of Point Danger).

Moved: Reg Payne Seconded: Trevor Stephenson
 Against: Ray White
 Abstained: Colin Dahl, Bill Pinkstone
 Motion CARRIED

- (c) Recommendation: **THAT** the AEC recommends to Australian Air Express (AAE) that their night freight operations should comply with the standard Noise Abatement Procedures preferred runway ie. land Rwy 14 and depart Rwy 14, with the refinement that arrivals Rwy 14 should follow Impulse's FSO and departures Rwy 14 should follow the northbound jet departure track ie. turn left onto 070° at 2DME. A.I. 7

Greg Carroll spoke against the motion highlighting several reasons why a "one off" acceptance of using Rwy 32 for Arr and Dep should be adopted for AAE (contrary to the preferred runway).

Moved: Wilf Ardill Seconded: Brian Talbot
 Against: Greg Carroll, Ray White, Pat Masen
 Abstained: Colin Dahl, Bill Bourke, Greg Marks, Sophie Arnison,
 Bill Pinkstone
 Motion CARRIED

Bill Bourke questioned the appropriateness of the AEC writing directly to an airline. Protocol calls for the Committee to go through DoTRS on operational matters. Vince Sutherland agreed that it was more appropriate for the Committee to make their recommendations through Airservices Australia or DoTRS which was in keeping with the scope of the Committee's powers as set out in the Terms of Reference.

Wilf Ardill thought that considering the amount of time spent by volunteers in formulating the recommendations, it would expedite any future action if the AEC directly approached the airlines involved with its recommendations.

Paul Lamont suggested that the AEC write to DoTRS with a "cc" to the airlines. Bill Bourke agreed to this course of action.

Therefore an amendment to the above motion to read:
"That the AEC recommend to Australian Air Express (AAE) through DoTRS" was generally agreed to by the committee.

- (d) Recommendation: **THAT** the AEC recommends to Australian Air Express (AAE) through DoTRS that the following procedures be implemented for night time freight operations when weather conditions require use of Rwy 32. A.I. 8

Rwy 32 Arrivals: IMC conditions - instrument approach;
Visual - straight in approach on centreline;
Rwy 32 Departures: as per jet departures right turn out over water

Moved: Greg Carroll Seconded: Pat Masen
Against: NIL
Abstained: Colin Dahl, Sophie Arnison, Bill Pinkstone
Motion CARRIED

- (e) Recommendation: **THAT** the sub-committee should continue to review trials and compliance with respect to FSO's by both Impulse and Australian Air Express. A.I. 9

At least one further sub-committee meeting be held following receipt of further track monitoring data from Airservices (post 5 February 1999).

Moved: Trevor Stephenson Seconded: Reg Payne
Against: NIL
Abstained: Colin Dahl, Sophie Arnison, Bill Pinkstone

In response to Jim MacAnally's question on who was the regulatory body to ensure compliance with FSO's, Bill Bourke answered that CASA was the responsible authority for ensuring night operations complied with the relevant Regulations.

Paul Lamont explained that the airlines concerned have expressed interest

in abiding by the procedures set down so that the intent of the committee can be achieved.

Note: Bob Brock had joined the meeting so the committee returned to previous Action Items which were to be dealt with by Airservices Australia.

A.I. 10 Bob Brock reiterated that Airservices has always maintained the view that turbo prop compliance for Rwy 32 arrivals would not be achieved fully because ATC needs to have the flexibility to move turbo props around. ASA will write to the respective airlines advising that there is a problem with compliance within the circuit area and explain what the committee is trying to achieve in respect of Ukerebagh Island.

A.I. 10

A.I. 11 Bob Brock explained that Cook Island is not shown on ATC maps. As the approach function is moving back to Brisbane radar maps will have Cook Island marked on it, therefore tracking off this point shouldn't be a problem.

A.I. 12 Bob Brock said in regard to Turbo Prop Rwy 14 departures (northbound) he would present track plots to next meeting as three tracks were to be trialled - 070° / 050° / 100°.

A.I. 11

A.I. 13 Reg Payne said aircraft were not turning "at 5DME". Bob Brock said that ATC had been turning aircraft "at 5DME" since 8 February 1999. After Reg suggested that aircraft should turn at 3DME, Bob replied that ATC would comply with what the AEC recommended, but believed now that Rwy 14 departures were supposedly part of the scope of the Flight Path Review.

Trevor Stephenson queried why ATC was instructing this turn, rather than it being an AIP instruction. Bob explained that 3-4 months notice was required to change an AIP procedure, hence the ATC instruction.

A.I. 15 Bob Brock reported that the 1800 noise complaint telephone number had not been able to be inserted in the 1999 Ballina/Kingscliff telephone directory as any changes to the directory had closed on 8 January 1999.

Ray White asked for the 1800 number to be publicised in the Gold Coast Bulletin and Tweed newspapers. Bob Brock replied that ASA had no plans to advertise the numbers other than in the telephone white pages.

Geoff Edwards suggested that the 1800 number could be publicised in the Tweed Link.

A.I. 16 Bob Brock advised that the 1800 number (1800 802 584) would be active early next week.

A.I. 12

A.I. 17 Draft letter to Minister re noise amelioration program (attached to Agenda)

Reg Payne said that previous governments had acknowledged that property owners suffering aircraft noise impacts should be compensated and therefore suggested that the wording of the letter be changed to read "noise compensation program".

impose noise abatement procedures on GA. ICAO is the governing body for such matters. Their current policy (only recently ratified) is that GA operations <5700kg are not bound by NAP's. CASA has some involvement but they do not have any regulatory power either.

Bill Bourke confirmed that any approaches on the matter should be made to the ICAO Committee, but to follow correct protocol the Committee should do this through DoTRS or Airservices.

DoTRS to confirm which agency is appropriate to liaison with ICAO on this matter.

- b) Jim queried the current status of the curfew at Coolangatta Airport.

A.I. 14

Vince Sutherland replied that the Minister is currently considering the matter and his final decision is expected shortly. He believed it would be advised to the Committee prior to the next meeting. The full administrative details would be advised as soon as possible.

In reply to a question from Jim Boyle about the possibility of the Minister introducing a total curfew, Vince replied that there was no intention of closing the airport altogether between 11:00 pm and 6:00 am (eg. night freighters would still be permitted).

Paul Lamont encouraged the Committee to wait for the Minister's reply before discussing the details of the curfew arrangement.

Ray White asked for an explanation regarding the arrival of a jet around midnight on Wednesday and could the Committee expect to receive an explanation from DoTRS/airline as required in the curfew arrangements. Bob Brock responded that there were no formal curfew arrangements yet in place.

After consultation with GCAL operations staff, Paul Lamont reported that the jet was an Ansett aircraft which had been delayed because of weather in Newcastle.

Ray White asked if ATC/AFFR were on duty at the time of the jet's arrival. Bob Brock said that as it was not an emergency situation, there was no regulatory requirement for them to be on duty. Ray White expressed his disappointment that this was the case.

South East Communities Combined Association (as attached to the Agenda)

Greg Carroll spoke about his first Notice of Motion regarding review of Rwy 14 departure flight paths. He advised that he would put it to the meeting under Agenda Item 6.

Reg Payne disagreed with the reasons given by Greg for the Notice of Motion

Trevor Stephenson said that the Chairman had led the meeting of the 5 February in what was to be included in the "agreed scope of the flight path review".

Paul Lamont said that he believed that there had been general agreement on what should be included in the scope, however he conceded that there was no formal vote taken.

Greg also advised that he would put his second and third Notices of Motion to the meeting under Agenda Item 6.

- **Banora Point Residents Association (now ACCA)**

This was deferred for discussion under Agenda Item 6.

6. **Flight Path Review process**

- **Report from DoTRS re technical criteria**

Vince Sutherland advised that the Department had undertaken to prepare a technical paper on aircraft operations, tolerances, etc. This was well in hand and he would forward it to the Committee as soon as all the relevant data from Airservices and the airlines had been collated.

- **Confirmation of Scope of Review**

Copy of letter dated 1 March 1999 from Mike Mrdak, DoTRS, to GCAL was distributed to the meeting. Vince Sutherland addressed the various points raised in the letter concerning the Department's understanding of the new review process; that it was a limited review of certain flight paths over the Tweed area, as well as general aviation and 24 hour operations. This would allow some further consideration to be given to a number of the options identified in the earlier Review, at the same time ensuring adequate community representation and consideration, but would not otherwise reopen the full gamut of flight paths options previously considered.

In response to a suggestion by Reg Payne, Adrian But commented that all aspects of the 1997/98 Flight Path Review were thoroughly explained to the Committee. If members are now saying that they did not understand what they were voting on, they should have indicated that at the time and asked for further information or clarification.

Review { Greg Carroll presented a map showing his version of the history of flight paths over the area and Reg Payne circulated his version of the history of southern flight paths in text format.

Greg Carroll moved the first Notice of Motion in his submission requesting THAT the proposed review of Rwy 14 departures be set aside until such

time as the proposal is considered, debated and voted upon by the AEC.

Seconded: Trevor Stephenson
Against: Reg Payne, Ray White
Abstain: Colin Dahl, Bob Brock, Jim Boyle, Bill Pinkstone
Motion CARRIED

Greg Carroll moved the second Notice of Motion in his submission (as amended) **THAT** the implementation of Rwy 14 departures, as recommended by the FPR and PIR and subsequent amendments, be completed. "Subsequent amendments" referred to the 5DME/2.5 refinements to the previous recommendations.

Greg then withdrew this motion as it was decided it was superfluous considering Motion (1) and the impending FPR.

Greg Carroll moved the third Notice of Motion in his submission **THAT** the review of Rwy 32 arrival jet south as per the agenda of the AEC meeting of 3 December 1998 and deferred to 5 February 1999, be proceeded with as a matter of priority.

Seconded: Trevor Stephenson
Against: Ray Tate, Reg Payne
Abstained: Colin Dahl, Bob Brock, Jim Boyle, Bill Pinkstone
Motion CARRIED

Jim Boyle moved **THAT** the scope of review should include GA and helicopters.

Seconded: Trevor Stephenson
Against: NIL
Abstained: Colin Dahl, Bob Brock, Greg Marks, Bill Bourke,
Geoff Edwards, Vince Sutherland, Bill Pinkstone,
Jim MacAnally

Motion CARRIED

Jim Boyle moved **THAT** the scope of review should include 24 hour operations.

Seconded: Trevor Stephenson
Against: NIL
Abstained: Colin Dahl, Bob Brock, Greg Marks, Bill Bourke,
Geoff Edwards, Vince Sutherland, Bill Pinkstone,

Reg Payne moved THAT the scope of review should include Rwy 14 departures.

Bill Bourke spoke against the motion, reiterating the industry's view against reviewing Rwy 14 departures. Bob Brock commented that Airservices was showing an ability to comply with the intention of the PIR. We should continue to monitor the situation before suggesting that further changes were necessary.

Seconded: Jim Boyle

For: Reg Payne, Ray Tate, Jim Boyle, Paul Lamont,
Vince Sutherland

Against: Bill Bourke, Greg Marks, Geoff Edwards, Trevor Stephenson,
Greg Carroll

Abstained: Colin Dahl, Bob Brock, Bill Pinkstone, Jim MacAnally,
Pat Masen, Roger Savage

Absentees: At this stage Sophie Arnison, Wilf Ardill, Ray White and Brian
Talbot had left the meeting and were not party to the vote.

Motion TIED VOTE (5) for, (5) against = motion defeated

From the outcome of above motions scope of review to include:

- Rwy 32 arrivals jet south
- GA and helicopter operations
- 24 hour operations

• **Discussion of Assessment Criteria**

This item was not discussed due to the absence from the meeting of a number of members.

A.I. 16

However Airservices had distributed to the meeting a paper on aircraft noise metrics which had been requested at the previous AEC meeting.

• **7. Paper Plane Operations**

This item had been dealt with under Action Item 14 arising from the previous meeting of 5/2/99.

• **8. Public submissions to the Post Implementation Review as submitted to the AEC by Airservices Australia**

This document had been distributed with the Agenda.

Greg Carroll pointed out that most of the submissions related to Rwy 32 arrivals. Bob Brock explained that the summary of issues contained in the document only related to items which were not pertinent to the PIR. Those that were relevant, were dealt with in the PIR.

- 9. **Airport Master Plan Update**
- 10. **Airport Environment Strategy Update**

Paul Lamont encouraged each organisation represented at the meeting to submit their feedback prior to the closing date for public comment on 19 April 1999.

He advised that a public meeting would be held on 18 March at the Tweed Civic Centre at 7:00 pm (NSW time) as part of the consultation process during the 90 day public review period.

Representatives of Gold Coast Airport Limited will present the Draft Master Plan and Draft Environment Strategy and will be available to address comments from those in attendance. This is to be a combined meeting for both Queensland and New South Wales communities due to time constraints of the Managing Director to be present at more than one meeting.

- 11. **Noise Enquiry Summary**

ASA distributed summary of enquiries received since 2 February 1999.

Bob Brock explained Tony Frodsham's role in the noise enquiry function. He also explained even though Tony was based in Brisbane he had familiarised himself with the Coolangatta environs and operational procedures. He could make further familiarisation trips if required in the future.

- 12. **General Business**

- **Notice of motion regarding proposal for Environment Sub-Committee**

Amanda Brigden spoke to the meeting about forming a sub-committee to discuss on airport environment issues that were of community concern. In response to her request for a display of interest in the proposal, Jim Boyle said his organisation would be interest in having someone attend. Due to some members not being present at this stage of the meeting Amanda offered to send a letter to each committee member seeking membership of an environment sub-committee.

Vince Sutherland suggested that the scope of responsibilities of such a sub-committee coming out of the Draft Environment Strategy needed to be determined. Amanda agreed that this would be discussed firstly.

Jim MacAnally moved **THAT** an environment sub-committee be formed.

Seconded: Greg Carroll
Against: NIL
Abstained: Vince Sutherland
Motion CARRIED

13. Dates for Future Meetings

Greg Carroll moved **THAT** the dates for future meetings as listed in Don Buckley's letter (attached to the agenda) be adopted i.e 8 April, 6 May, 3 June, 1 July, 5 August, 2 September, 7 October, 4 November, 2 December 1999.

Seconded: Trevor Stephenson
Against: NIL
Abstained: Vince Sutherland
Motion CARRIED

The meeting closed at 14:10 pm.

Don James
CHAIRMAN

NEW SEGMENT:

Quote of the Day:

In reference to Airservice Australia's intentions not to advertise the noise enquiry toll free number, other than in the telephone white pages and the Tweed Link, Bob Brock said that as far as he was aware there were three main ways of getting a message across:

- television; telegraph; and tell "Jim" !!!

We'll see if it works! Thanks for the interjection of some light humour fellows!